

ENVIRONMENT SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

16 January 2018

5.30 - 7.30 pm

Present: Councillors Gawthrope (Chair), Bird (Vice-Chair), Abbott, Bick, Ratcliffe, Sheil and Tunnacliffe

Executive Councillor for Planning Policy and Transport: Kevin Blencowe

Executive Councillor for Environmental Services and City Centre: Rosy Moore

Officers:

Strategic Director: Fiona Bryant

Head of Commercial Services: James Elms

Commercial Operations Manager: Sean Cleary

Principal Accountant (Services): Chris Humphris

Dan Ritchie: Markets and Street Trading Development Manager

Committee Manager: Claire Tunnicliffe

Others Present:

Head of Shared Waste: Head of Shared Waste

SCDC Director of Health & Environmental Services: Mike Hill

FOR THE INFORMATION OF THE COUNCIL

Change to the Published Agenda Order

Under paragraph 4.2.1 of the Council Procedure Rules, the Chair used his discretion to alter the order of the agenda items. However, for ease of the reader, these minutes will follow the order of the agenda.

18/1/Env Apologies

Apologies were received from Councillor Sergeant. Councillor Abbott attended as the alternate.

18/2/Env Declarations of Interest

No declarations of interest were made.

18/3/Env Minutes

The minutes of the meeting held on 3 October were approved as a correct record and signed by the Chair.

18/4/Env Public Questions

There were no public questions.

18/5/Env Decision Taken by Executive Councillor

18/5/ENVa Replacement of Car Parking Control Equipment at Park Street Multi Storey Car Park

The decision was noted.

18/6/Env Shop-mobility Services Review**Matter for Decision**

To consider the options for the shop-mobility service.

Decision of Executive Councillor for Planning Policy & Transport

- i. Approved the Introduction of annual membership fee & hire charge for equipment whilst maintaining the shopping escort and bus stop and Dial a Ride collection services.

Reason for the Decision

As set out in the Officer's report.

Any Alternative Options Considered and Rejected

Not applicable.

Scrutiny Considerations

The Committee received a report from the Commercial Operations Manager which referred to the withdrawal of funding contributions from Cambridgeshire County Council in 2016 of £49,500. The shop-mobility service had continued to operate using the General Fund to cover the £49,500 shortfall with a budgeted cost of £165,000 for the current 2017/18 financial year.

The Commercial Operations Manager, the Head of Commercial Services and Strategic Director said the following in response to Members' questions:

- i. Noted the comments regarding a valued service.
- ii. Research showed that Cambridge City Council was the only local authority who offered a free shop mobility service with escorted shopping and the 'dial a ride service'.
- iii. Abled bodied lonely people did not have access to the service.
- iv. Of the approximately 1500 service users a total of 36% were Cambridge residents.
- v. With the introduction of charges a minimum reduction of 20% in usage had been forecasted. This had been viewed as a cautious approach which had been built into the budget, although the figure could be higher or lower.
- vi. Service users would be given an opportunity to provide feedback on the changes via different media services.

The Executive Councillor reiterated Cambridge BID and significant trade representatives had been consulted, those who had responded said that they would not make a monetary contribution but supported this approach as a way of sustaining the service.

Councillor Tunnacliffe proposed to defer the decision of the Committee in order to find alternative sources of revenue to maintain a free shop-mobility service

Councillor Bick seconded the proposal.

The proposal was lost by 2 votes to 5.

The Committee endorsed the recommendation by 5 votes to 0.

The Executive Councillor approved the recommendation.

Conflicts of Interest Declared by the Executive Councillor (and any Dispensations Granted)

No conflicts of interest were declared by the Executive Councillor

18/7/Env PP&T Portfolio Revenue and Capital Budget Proposals for 2018/19 to 2022/23

Matter for Decision

The report detailed the budget proposals relating to the Planning Policy and Transport portfolio that were included in the Budget-Setting Report (BSR) 2018/19.

Decision of Executive Councillor for Planning Policy and TransportReview of Charges:

i. Approved the proposed charges for this portfolio's services and facilities, as shown in Appendix A of the Officer's report.

Revenue:

ii. Noted the revenue budget proposals as shown in Appendix B of the Officer's report.

Capital:

iii. Noted that there are no capital bids or savings presented for this portfolio.

Reason for the Decision

As set out in the Officer's report.

Any Alternative Options Considered and Rejected

Not applicable.

Scrutiny Considerations

The Committee received a report from the Principal Accountant (Services).

Councillor Bick noted the increase in parking fees as a 'step in the right direction' and questioned what had prompted the change which recognised a broader car park strategy (last year there was a reduction in charges).

The Executive Councillor stated a good working relationship had been established with Cambridgeshire County Council and Greater Cambridge Partnership looking at transport issues in and around the City including ways to reduce congestion; such as the County's proposed removal of parking charges at the park and ride sites. It was hoped that the change in parking fees would encourage a proportion of drivers to change their habits and use the park and ride sites or the bus network. This would be monitored over the year to see if there had been a change.

The Committee endorsed the recommendations by 5 votes to 0.

The Executive Councillor approved the recommendations.

Conflicts of Interest Declared by the Executive Councillor (and any Dispensations Granted)

No conflicts of interest were declared by the Executive Councillor

18/8/Env ES&CC Portfolio Revenue and Capital Budget Proposals for 2018/19 to 2022/23

Matter for Decision

The report detailed the budget proposals relating to the Waste Services and City Centre portfolio that were included in the Budget-Setting Report (BSR) 2018/19.

Decision of Executive Councillor for Environmental Services and City Centre.

Review of Charges:

- i. Approved the proposed charges for this portfolio's services and facilities, as shown in Appendix A of the Officer's report.

Revenue:

- ii. Noted the revenue budget proposals as shown in Appendix B of the Officer's report.

Capital:

- iii. Noted the capital budget proposals as shown in Appendix C of the Officer's report.

Reason for the Decision

As set out in the Officer's report.

Any Alternative Options Considered and Rejected

Not applicable.

Scrutiny Considerations

The Committee received a report from the Principal Accountant (Services).

In response to Members' questions the Principal Account (Services) and the Head of Shared Waste Services said the following:

- i. Would report back the number of staff that the 5% pension increase (Visit Cambridge & Beyond VCB) unbudgeted provision over twelve months related to and the total budget cost.
- ii. The charge to remove domestic appliances of three items had always been included in the budget but as people generally disposed of one item at a time this new charge for one item had been introduced
- iii. Suppliers of domestic appliances had a legal responsibility to take them away if requested.

The Strategic Director confirmed she would advise outside the meeting the level of electric power achievable on the vehicle replacements referenced on page 74 of the agenda pack.

The Executive Councillor advised the Market Square Project would be carried in conjunction with the movement and spaces project.

The Committee endorsed the recommendations by 5 votes to 0.

The Executive Councillor approved the recommendations.

Conflicts of Interest Declared by the Executive Councillor (and any Dispensations Granted)

No conflicts of interest were declared by the Executive Councillor

18/9/Env Shared Waste Service – Post Day Change Update

Matter for Decision

The report detailed the shared waste service ABCD (Alternative Bin Collection Day) initial project review from planning and design to month 9 of operations.

Decision of Executive Councillor for Environmental Services and City Centre.

- i. Noted the report for information.

Reason for the Decision

As set out in the Officer's report.

Any Alternative Options Considered and Rejected

Not applicable.

Scrutiny Considerations

The Committee received a report from the Head of Shared Waste Services which referred to the original business case creating a shared service with new collection rounds. This had been devised to ensure efficiency and to achieve target savings of £700,000 over three years. These changes meant that residents had a change in day and / or sequence of bin collections, which started on 27 February 2017.

The report provided a review of collections and the lessons learnt over the nine month period.

In response to Members' questions the Head of Shared Waste Services and the Health and Environmental Services Director (South Cambridgeshire District Council) said the following:

- i. Welcomed Members feedback.
- ii. Recognised that errors had been made. The changes had been complex, difficult and on a large scale.
- iii. Lessons had been learnt and there were things that could and would be done differently.
- iv. A Project Manager was now in place to oversee the implementation of the ICT for shared waste services and had engaged with the wider stakeholders and would continue to do so.
- v. Acknowledged that shared ownership of bins stores did create a problem, particularly when one of the parties was a commercial business but access issues were currently being addressed.
- vi. Apologised to all residents who had their bins missed during collections.
- vii. Praised the hard work of the refuse crews who had a very hard and physical job. They had shown great dedication to improve the service with the high levels of successful collections over the nine months and would continue to do so.
- viii. South Cambridgeshire District Council operatives had always started at 6.00am while those who had transferred from the City Council started at 7.00am. The reason was that those starting at 7.00am before the transfer would have had very little travel time to their destinations. As the refuse trucks left at 6.00AM from Waterbeach there was a thirty minutes

travel time in to the City. The route was carefully planned to minimise noise around the City. This was one area of the service which was yet to be harmonised but would be looked at once the best system has been determined.

- ix. The new vehicles would also be quieter as well as being environmentally friendlier.

The Strategic Director advised that a Shared Management Board had been set up to oversee the amalgamation of future shared services and would share the corporate learning from previous projects.

The Committee and the Executive Councillor noted the report.

Conflicts of Interest Declared by the Executive Councillor (and any Dispensations Granted)

No conflicts of interest were declared by the Executive Councillor

18/10/Env Proposed Revisions to Market Fees and Charges for 2018/19 Financial Year

Matter for Decision

The report detailed the proposed changes to the market fees and charges for the financial year 2018/19.

Decision of Executive Councillor for Waste Services and City Centre.

- i. Approved the price changes for market fees and charges for the financial year 2018/19 as set out in the Officer's report:

Reason for the Decision

As set out in the Officer's report.

Any Alternative Options Considered and Rejected

Not applicable.

Scrutiny Considerations

The Committee received a report from the Markets and Street Trading Development Manager.

The report highlighted that on the General & Sunday Market, the Premium pitches continued to perform very well for all days of trading. The Standard

pitches also performed well, between Wednesday and Sunday. To increase the attractiveness of the Standard pitches on Mondays and Tuesdays on the General & Sunday Market, the proposal was to drop the charge. To compensate for the associated reduction in income arising from the proposed reduction in charge, would see an introduction of applying a marginally higher than corporate recommended inflationary adjustment to the fees for the daily Premium pitches and for the standard pitches, between Wednesday and Sunday.

In response to Members' questions the Markets and Street Trading Development Manager said the following:

- i. There had been no charge to the market traders who took part in five night markets held in 2017 giving an additional opportunity for income and potential new client base.
- ii. There had been a 70% spending increase for cleansing the market than two years ago. This included in the increase an additional 2 hours mid-day clean seven days a week.
- iii. Acknowledged that there was more that could be done to improve the market.
- iv. Cambridge City Council offered free social media classes to the market traders in order to promote their business and the market.
- v. Believed the charges to be fair and balanced, highlighting the reduction of charges of a standard pitch to trade in the centre of Cambridge on Monday and Tuesday.
- vi. Traders also needed to take responsibility for the cleansing and hygiene of the market. There had been a number of proposals put forward in item 12 of the agenda (Revisions to General & Sunday Charter) to improve the cleanliness and waste problems which had been highlighted by the traders.

The Executive Councillor stated the Market Team worked very hard to ensure that the market was run seven days a week. The team had recently won the national award 'Market Team of the Year' and Cambridge had placed second in 'Britain's Favourite Market'. She acknowledged the negative comments from the survey but stated there were also positive comments. It was hoped that the £10.00 pitches would encourage more traders which would bring more business to all and have a full market on Mondays and Tuesdays.

One of the issues with cleanliness was the boards which the traders were given on a daily basis and asked to return at the end of the day. Due to instances of the boards being left out overnight (which hindered the cleaning of them by the street cleansing team) this had prompted the change in regulation.

The Executive Councillor concluded that she would look further into the matter of the issue of the market being left in need of an emergency clean in the morning (when required) and highlighted Cambridge BID's call out team for emergency cleaning.

The Committee endorsed the recommendations by 5 votes to 0.

The Executive Councillor approved the recommendations.

Conflicts of Interest Declared by the Executive Councillor (and any Dispensations Granted)

No conflicts of interest were declared by the Executive Councillor

18/11/Env Revisions to All Saints Gardens Terms & Conditions of Trading

Matter for Decision

The report detailed the proposed changes to the All Saints Gardens (ASG) Market Terms & Conditions (T&C).

Decision of Executive Councillor for Environmental Services and City Centre.

- i. Approved the adoption of the proposed changes to the All Saints Gardens (ASG) Market Terms & Conditions (T&C) as set out in Appendix A of the Officer's report.

Reason for the Decision

As set out in the Officer's report.

Any Alternative Options Considered and Rejected

Not applicable.

Scrutiny Considerations

The Committee received a report from the City Centre Management, Markets and Street Trading Development Manager. The report noted the All Saints Gardens (ASG) Market Terms & Conditions (T&C) had not been reviewed for at least four years.

A number of the proposed revisions were to remove terminology that was no longer relevant whilst other proposals were aimed at improving the performance of the market.

There was no debate on this item.

The Executive Councillor approved the recommendations.

Conflicts of Interest Declared by the Executive Councillor (and any Dispensations Granted)

No conflicts of interest were declared by the Executive Councillor

18/12/Env Revisions to General & Sunday Charter Market Regulations

Matter for Decision

The report detailed the proposed changes to the Charter Market Regulations (CMR).

Decision of Executive Councillor for Enviromental Services and City Centre.

- i. Approved the adoption of the proposed changes to the Charter Market Regulations (CMR) Terms & Conditions as set out in Appendix A of the Officer's report.

Reason for the Decision

As set out in the Officer's report.

Any Alternative Options Considered and Rejected

Not applicable.

Scrutiny Considerations

The Committee received a report from the City Centre Management, Markets and Street Trading Development Manager. The report noted the General & Sunday Charter Market Regulations had not been reviewed for seven years.

A number of the proposed revisions were to remove terminology that was no longer relevant whilst other proposals were aimed at improving the performance of the market.

There was no debate on this item.

The Executive Councillor did not take the decision but advised she would wait until five working days had passed to be in accordance with the access to information requirements of the Constitution.

This was because Appendix A referenced in the report which had the proposed recommendations had not been included in the agenda and was only published the day before the meeting.

The Executive Councillor approved the recommendation on 22 January 2018.

Conflicts of Interest Declared by the Executive Councillor (and any Dispensations Granted)

No conflicts of interest were declared by the Executive Councillor

The meeting ended at 7.30 pm

CHAIR